Freedom of Mobility: The Paradoxes

*Our best chance for future prosperity is taking a globally integrated approach to immigration.*

- Dambisa Moyo

**Introduction**

It was an unusual cremation ceremony, and the villagers were bewildered. Rajesh, as he contemplated how events unfurled over the past year, was overcome by a deep sense of grief. Convinced that his father’s dead body would not be repatriated to Nepal, he decided to proceed with the final rites, without the actual body.

Rajesh’s father, Ajay Kumar, came from Ramechhap, a remote district in central-west Nepal. He was a father to four children and a mason by profession who, at 40 years old, had decided to leave Nepal for Saudi Arabia. Like many other South Asian migrant workers, he was attracted by the promise of a stable, well-paying job in the Middle East or Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC) countries, and the possibility of a more financially secure future. On a friend’s recommendation, Ajay had approached a sub-agent, who recommended a job as a dispatch worker in Dammam, Saudi Arabia. Pay was supposed to be relatively high, with good working conditions and clean accommodation.

However, to accept the offer he was obliged to pay a sum of 200,000 rupees¹ (approximately USD 1,900) as a recruitment fee to the sub-agent and the main recruiting agency in Kathmandu. He was promised that this sum would be returned to him in addition to his first-month salary by his employer. Faced with limited options, Ajay was compelled to borrow 150,000 rupees from a local money lender at an annual interest rate of 35%. In addition to his modest savings, Ajay pooled resources from his family to purchase an air ticket to Riyadh.

Ajay reached Dammam, Saudi Arabia in July 2008 where he was met by his employer, who took possession of his passport, as allowed for under the terms of employment governed by the *kafala* system (see Box 1). He soon found out that he would, in fact, be employed as a construction worker, and was informed by his employer that there was a confusion in the terms of contract but that he would be compensated as agreed. Two months passed, but Ajay was only paid half of the salary he was promised. He tried to contact his recruiting agency but they did not answer his calls. 15-hour workdays, overcrowded accommodation, and limited social interaction soon led Ajay to seek new employment. However, as his identification documents had been seized by his previous employer, he was compelled to adopt a falsified name, which rendered him an illegal worker.

---

¹ Currency of Nepal
BOX 1

Kafala System

The kafala (sponsorship) system was a framework that governs the relationship between migrant workers and their employers in the GCC countries. Without the permission of the kafeel (the sponsor), the migrant worker can neither enter nor exit the country. With rapid economic development, the GCC countries needed to import millions of low skilled workers quickly, and this system was introduced to manage the influx. It mandated that the sponsor was required to monitor the whereabouts of the migrants. Also, it was intended to ensure that migrants did not attain citizenship, labelling them as 'guest workers' or 'expatriate manpower'.

It is called a "sponsorship system" because employers are required to sponsor the visas, flight costs, and other expenses of bringing workers into the country. This effectively gives employers the power to determine the legal status of a worker. For the employer, it ensures that workers do not leave before the end of their contracted term of employment. As employers incur costs in the recruitment process, the kafala system give them overwhelming power over the migrant workers. This led to abuse by many employers, especially in terms of curtailing the migrant worker's mobility.

The system operated in a manner such that as soon as a worker arrived in the countries of destination (COD), his or her passport was taken away by the employer. It forbade workers from switching to another job and prevented them from leaving the country without the permission of the sponsor. As such, migrant workers were forced to continue working with the same employer even when they were working under abusive conditions. But if a migrant worker did choose to leave the employment for which they were brought into the country, they were deemed to be an "illegal migrant" and would face punitive action.

Human Rights Watch stated that "some abusive employers exploit the kafala system and force domestic workers to continue working against their will and forbid them from returning to their countries of origin."

Status of Kafala system across GCC countries:
There was variation in commitments from the governments of GCC countries towards reforming the kafala system. While Bahrain and Qatar had already repealed the kafala system, there were concerns about the lack of enforcement. It could not be denied that, under global pressure, GCC governments were seeking to amend or repeal the system, but

---

3 Ibid
these were not concerted efforts. For example, in Bahrain, the system was repealed, but the government had yet to ensure that employers complied with the new rules.⁶

Desiring to return to Nepal because of his illegal status, Ajay, unaware of where to seek assistance, ventured to the police; however, due to his illegal immigration status, he was imprisoned and subsequently passed away in April 2012 in Dammam hospital where he was treated for pneumonia. His family was only informed of his death more than a year later in July 2013, and it was another 4 years before his remains were repatriated to Nepal in February 2017.

**What caused the delay?**

Despite months of regular contact with the Nepal Embassy in Saudi Arabia, the body of Ajay Kumar could not be identified until April 2016. His body had been mistaken for the body of another person due to a mistake in registration by the hospital that treated him. In April 2016, the Nepali Embassy confirmed to the Centre for Migration and International Relations (CMIR), a research and rescue NGO based in Kathmandu, that the body would be sent back to Nepal very soon. However, no progress was made for weeks. The Embassy cited several reasons for this delay including budget constraints and administrative issues stemming from his use of a different name.

For the body to be repatriated, various official documents had to be prepared, e.g. a death certificate, in addition to other legal processes. Eventually, the body was brought back through the deportation centre as it was impossible to send the body through the usual channels due to complications arising out of the mismatch of names. Due to the pressure of the Nepali Embassy and with the assistance of a cargo company, all necessary documents were finalized in February 2017 and an air ticket was purchased.

**A call to action**

While the case of Ajay Kumar was an extreme one, the story of unethical recruitment, systematic exploitation and poor protection of migrant workers was common.

Spurred by this case, the Department of Foreign Employment (DoFE) requested that the Centre for Migration and International Relations (CMIR) prepare an updated report on Nepali migrant workers either incarcerated or whose dead bodies were yet to be repatriated to Nepal (see **Exhibit 2**). DoFE asked CMIR to compile recommendations on streamlining processes to ensure that the rights of migrant workers were safeguarded, to highlight gaps in current frameworks, and to propose mechanisms by which the plight of migrants such as Ajay could be brought to light and addressed collaboratively.

---

Gargi, an intern at CMIR who was in charge of corresponding with respective Embassies, the family of Ajay Kumar, and other relevant authorities involved in the repatriation process was delegated this task and decided to identify common issues by compiling snapshots of information from migrant workers and their families (Table 1).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name and profile</th>
<th>Background and current status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Rupa Maya</strong></td>
<td>Rupa worked in Bahrain as a domestic worker for 5 years. Abused by her employer on repeated occasions, Rupa fled Bahrain in 2013 after accumulating sufficient funds to repay debts and buy a plot of land in Okhaldunga district.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Rajendra K.C.</strong></td>
<td>Rajendra has been employed as a migrant worker for over 15 years in multiple jobs in the construction sector in Qatar and the UAE. Currently in Nepal, he plans to return to Qatar to take up a new job to pay off a debt of 330,000 rupees owed to a local recruitment agency.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Anup Sharma</strong></td>
<td>Anup has met his mother 4 times since she left abroad. His alcoholic father left his family when he was 3 years old, forcing his mother to seek employment in Saudi Arabia as a domestic worker. Raised by his grandparents, Anup hoped to leave home soon to find a job in the Middle East.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Utsav Poudel</strong></td>
<td>Utsav left for Qatar in 2011 to work as a plumber. However, the company contact in Qatar was another recruiting agency which directed him to a construction company. Utsav was provided accommodation in a shared room with 4 other migrant workers from South and Southeast Asia. Deductions were made from his salary for various fees, for which no proper explanation was given.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Rahim Ali</strong></td>
<td>Rahim has worked across the Middle East in various capacities, including as a construction worker, cleaner and mason. Working in the Middle East enabled Rahim to gradually acquire land, which he intended to give to his daughters.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Paras Neupane</strong></td>
<td>Paras was promised a sum of 1200 Riyal according to the Employment Agreement he signed in Kathmandu. While the working conditions were decent, being paid only 800 Riyal was not acceptable. He worked at the same company for 7 months and asked the employer to return his passport. The employer instead reported him to the police. After having been imprisoned for 4 months, he was fortunate enough to receive amnesty “declared by Custodian of the Two Holy Mosques King Salman” in 2015. Back in Nepal, he and his wife ran a small-scale food joint.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 1:** Excerpt of profiles of migrant workers from Nepal

---

7 Character’s name, title, and assigned task are fictionalised versions of true stories.
8 The most pervasive problem faced by migrant workers arise from issues pertaining to the Employment Agreement (EA). In most cases, the original EAs signed at COO are replaced with a new one once the migrant reaches the COD. The original EA signed at COO is usually created to deceive authorities at both COO and COD-to make it look like all regulations have been followed, at least “on paper”.
10 The characters and experiences outlined are fictionalised versions of actual events.
Regional labour migration
In the second half of the 20th century, rapid economic growth in the Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC) countries necessitated importing large numbers of low-skilled labour migrants especially from South Asia. It was estimated that over 2.5 million workers left South Asia every year as contract workers,11 a majority of whom migrated to the Gulf States to take up jobs in the construction industry, domestic work, and other service industries. This number was set to rise because of declining working populations in countries of destination (COD) coupled with a growing need for skilled workers and service personnel. Given the magnitude of these movements, the management of migration by governments at both ends was of increasing importance.

Labour migration was rife with issues including, but not restricted to, abuse and exploitation, irregularity, contract contraventions, and trafficking in persons and smuggling. The management of migration by both countries of origin (COO) and CODs was of increasing importance and could benefit both COOs and CODs. In this context, there was a case for international cooperation to successfully manage migration.

The economic benefits of migration to both the host country and country of origin were significant; in CODs, migrants played a key role in the labour market in filling skills shortages for both high- and low-skilled occupations.12 The GCC countries required skilled labour to grow; in fact, foreigners accounted for at least 75% of the labour force in all GCC countries,13 and this was set to increase (see Exhibit 5).

For COOs, remittances were an important stimulus of economic development, particularly in rural areas.14 For example, remittances accounted for more than one third of Nepal’s GDP; likewise, they accounted for more than 8% of the GDP of Bangladesh and Sri Lanka.15 Further, as indicated in Exhibit 7, remittances continued to grow steadily in major labour-sending countries.

Mismanagement of labour migration could reinforce power asymmetries between employers and employees, leading to irregularity of migrant workers and high human costs. One example of this was the exploitation of contractual employees for the ongoing construction for the FIFA World Cup 2022 to be held in Qatar (see Box 3).

Distributing the economic benefits fairly was, therefore, imperative for both labour-sending and labour-receiving countries, and this has been acknowledged by the global community. Recognising the challenges faced by migrants and refugees, the need for a global framework on migration to improve governance, and to strengthen the economic contributions of

12 OECD, ‘Is Migration Good for the Economy?’, Migration Policy Debates No 2 (OECD, 2014)
migrants, the New York Declaration for Refugees and Migrants,\textsuperscript{16} adopted in September 2016, led to the decision to develop a Global Compact on Migration (GCM) to promote ‘safe orderly and regular migration’.\textsuperscript{17} The development of the GCM was a year-long process that involved consultations across the world, culminating in an intergovernmental conference in September 2018 which was envisaged to lead to adoption of principles on governance of migration. However, as with other international frameworks which called for intergovernmental cooperation, the outcomes of this process would be non-binding. In addition, key players such as the USA have opted out of the GCM,\textsuperscript{18} demonstrating the challenges of obtaining buy-in from all relevant stakeholders.

Faced with the dilemma of identifying specific mechanisms through which the benefits of migration could be harnessed while ensuring that the rights of workers are respected, Gargi considered Regional Consultative Processes (RCPs) as platforms for information exchange, trust-building and drivers of change.\textsuperscript{19}

**Regional Consultative Processes – a vehicle for progress?**

Regional Consultative Processes (RCPs) were regional meetings of states dedicated to discussions on migration, which varied in composition, purpose, and frameworks.\textsuperscript{20} RCPs such as the Colombo Process aimed to provide a platform for government institutions with mandates relevant to overseas employment to raise and discuss issues related to contractual labour from their respective countries (see Box 2 for further information).

To eliminate harmful recruitment practices and exploitation of workers, and to safeguard the rights of migrant workers, multi-stakeholder platforms such as RCPs have been initiated, but the divergence of interests of the stakeholders in both GCC countries as well as COO have hindered meaningful progress. Despite the existence of such forums, unethical recruitment and abuse remained very much a reality for South Asian migrant workers, highlighting the continued prevalence of systemic institutional gaps, and challenges in translating policy into practice.

\textsuperscript{20} Ibid.
BOX 2

The Colombo Process

Established in 2003 as a forum which aimed to facilitate dialogue and cooperation between labour sending and receiving countries, the Colombo Process consisted of 12 labour-sending member states from South and Southeast Asia. The Colombo Process had three areas of focus, which were: i) Protecting and providing services to migrant workers; ii) Optimising benefits of organised labour migration; and iii) Capacity building, data collection and inter-state cooperation.

Currently chaired by Nepal, the Colombo Process had five thematic areas for which working groups, consisting of 5-6 member countries, were operationalised. These thematic areas were: i) Skills and qualification recognition; ii) Fostering ethical recruitment; iii) Effective pre-departure orientation and empowerments; iv) Remittances and; v) Labour Market Analysis.

The membership of the Colombo Process consisted of nearly 30% of the global migrant labour force. The forum has made several recommendations in relation to human and labour rights of workers from the South Asia region. However, the translation of these outcomes into concrete policy actions was moderate, owing to a lack of binding recommendations, and gaps in monitoring.

BOX 3

Behind the glamour of 2022 FIFA World Cup, Qatar

Apart from being on the international media for the recent diplomatic crisis leading to an air, sea and land blockade, and the controversy arising out of FIFA’s decision to nominate it as the host country of World Cup 2022, the tiny Gulf nation of Qatar earned a bad reputation for not doing enough to ensure minimal human rights protections for its foreign migrants.

The world’s biggest sporting event and the largest one that the entire Middle Eastern region would have hosted inevitably drew widespread attention from the world, but not only for the right reasons. The International Trade Union Confederation (ITUC) warned that up to 4,000 workers could die by the time of the first kick-off in the championship in 2022, if drastic changes in the current working conditions were not made. Most of the deaths which have occurred to date were attributed to extreme working conditions, including long working hours, lax safety measures, and exposure to very high temperatures, and poor sanitation and medication facilities for the migrants.

It was estimated that a staggering amount of USD200 billion would be invested, associated with the infrastructure for the World Cup such as stadiums, new roads, hospitals, rail links etc., compared to the USD10.7 billion spent by Russia for the 2018 World Cup.\footnote{BBC, 'Qatar spending $500m a week on World Cup infrastructure projects,’ accessed on January 4, http://www.bbc.com/news/world-middle-east-38905510}

While there were concerns raised by human rights organizations that the working conditions of migrant workers were destitute, and Amnesty International referred to it as being on the verge of "forced labor" (based on interviews of numerous of them working there\footnote{Amnesty International, 'Qatar: Abuse of migrant workers remains widespread as World Cup stadium hosts first match,’ accessed on January 4, https://www.amnesty.org/en/latest/news/2017/05/qatar-world-cup-stadium-first-match/}); the sudden surge in international attention came after The Guardian, a UK-based newspaper, sought to investigate the plight of construction workers.\footnote{The Guardian, ‘Qatar World Cup construction ‘will leave 4,000 migrant workers dead,’ accessed on January 5, https://www.theguardian.com/global-development/2013/sep/26/qatar-world-cup-migrant-workers-dead}

![Population of Qatar: Nationals vs Foreigners](image)


**Existing challenges**

Cases like that of Ajay Kumar were not uncommon and governments of both sending and receiving countries have realized the constructive role that inter-governmental platforms could offer, but they were faced with gaps in institutional capacity, policy and implementation.

Some such challenges were:

1. **Coordination across multiple governments (of labour sending and receiving countries)**

   Steps were taken to protect the rights of migrant workers in most South Asian countries. For example, in 2014, India implemented a bank guarantee norm of US$2,500 for employers in Kuwait wishing to recruit female domestic workers. This acted as a security particularly where salaries were withheld, or the
domestic worker required compensation or financial support to return home.\textsuperscript{29} However, there were lags in policy implementation stemming from difficulties in achieving consensus between countries of destination and countries of origin. Further, at the country level, there were challenges in coordination between agencies.

\textit{ii) Cross-sectoral collaboration}

Discussions surrounding migration in RCPs and other such platforms tended to place an emphasis on governments. However, civil society organisations and the private sector had much to add to these discussions. For example, the Migrant Forum in Asia (MFA) was a network of civil society organisations and NGOs across Asia, which had vast experience in labour rights issues and advocacy.\textsuperscript{30} Leveraging the knowledge and experience of actors such as MFA could be of great benefit to both COO and COD.

\textit{iii) Lack of dissemination of information to migrant workers}

In many cases, the inequality between employers and foreign workers was reinforced by an inadequacy of language skills, which meant that these workers were not aware of their existing rights, grievance/complaint mechanisms, and redressal measures. Access to pre-departure orientation and post-arrival training was of importance; for example, Nepal introduced the pre-departure orientation seminar (PDOS) as a key component of protecting workers; this was made mandatory for departing workers in 2004. Elements of the training include ‘the geography, culture, lifestyle and the economic, social and political context of the destination country; language of the destination country and; labour, immigration laws’.\textsuperscript{31}

\textit{iv) Non-binding nature of international frameworks}

Several institutional frameworks related to migration governance had non-binding targets. For example, in November 2017, ASEAN leaders signed the ASEAN Consensus on the Promotion of the Rights of Migrant Workers, which aimed to protect migrant labour in ASEAN countries. However, this pact was non-binding and the responsibility of meeting the outlined commitments fell under ‘the self-awareness of each state’.\textsuperscript{32} This meant that member states were not obliged to comply by these principles, and compliance was not monitored.

\textsuperscript{29} First Post, ‘India’s move to scrap bank guarantee for women domestic workers in Kuwait will harm their rights’, accessed January 26, 2018, \url{http://www.firstpost.com/india/indias-move-to-scrap-bank-guarantee-for-women-domestic-workers-in-kuwait-will-harm-their-rights-4022979.html}
\textsuperscript{30} Migrant Forum in Asia, accessed January 26, 2018, \url{http://mfasia.org/}
\textsuperscript{31} IOM and Migration Policy Institute, ‘Strengthening Pre-departure orientation programmes in Indonesia, Nepal and the Philippines’, \textit{Issue In Brief}, (IOM and Migration Policy Institute, 2012)
Discussion on Policy Options
Having conducted research on cases such as that of Ajay Kumar, and analysing the value of RCPs, Gargi considered the following policy options:

i) Ensuring compliance with legal frameworks and addressing gaps in order to protect the rights of migrant workers, identifying non-compliance with the assistance of local actors, such as NGOs, and enforcing punitive measures at the national level.

ii) Formalising the outcomes of RCPs to make them binding, or integrating these outcomes into the existing legal frameworks of member countries such as Nepal.

iii) Implementing compulsory pre-departure orientation for all migrant workers at no fee. The training would include a module on the kafala system and grievance procedures for workers at COD.

iv) Creating inter-ministerial committees in COOs involving institutions mandated to manage overseas labour, embassies, and reintegration services for migrants upon their return, monitoring compliance with existing conventions and regulations, acting as quick response teams when cases arose.

v) Implementing an electronic system for payment of recruitment fees to ensure that prospective migrant workers were not overcharged.

After considering the gaps in existing frameworks and the continued plight of migrant workers, what should Gargi’s recommendation to the Department of Foreign Employment be?

Consider the challenges of translating outcomes decided at a regional level into national frameworks, effectiveness at managing the interests of multiple stakeholders, and balancing economic opportunities with the protection of human and labour rights.

Epilogue
Since his father’s death, Rajesh played an active role in educating the youth of his village. He encouraged them to be very careful about the terms and conditions that recruitment agencies promise aspiring migrants, and the difficulties they would most likely face in the country of destination. In his spare time, he volunteered at the district school, seeking to caution young people that the best way they could safeguard their own rights was by becoming educated. He told them with some resignation, “young people have made up their mind to migrate to GCC countries. No one is willing to stay back and develop Nepal.” With 3 years’ savings, Rajesh finally paid off the debt that his father had incurred during the recruitment process.
Exhibit 1: The return of Bam Bahadur Tamang’s body to Nepal

Source: E-Kantipur

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fiscal year</th>
<th>Sex</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008/09</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009/10</td>
<td>399</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010/11</td>
<td>541</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011/12</td>
<td>632</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012/13</td>
<td>716</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013/14</td>
<td>864</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014/15</td>
<td>996</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>4,235</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Exhibit 2: Total reported number of Nepali migrant workers’ deaths during foreign employment, by sex, 2008/09 – 2014/15

Source: Department of Foreign Employment (Nepal), Labour Migration for Employment: A status report for Nepal 2014/15 (Department of Foreign Employment, 2016)

---

33 Bam Bahadur Tamang was a Nepali migrant worker in Saudi Arabia whose body was returned to Nepal 5 years after his death
34 Kathmandu Post, ‘Home he returns, in a coffin, almost 6 years after death,’
Exhibit 3: Trends in Annual Labour Outflow from selected South Asian countries 1990-2015

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Years</th>
<th>Bangladesh</th>
<th>India</th>
<th>Nepal</th>
<th>Pakistan</th>
<th>Sri Lanka</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>103,814</td>
<td>139,861</td>
<td>83,020</td>
<td>115,520</td>
<td>4,2625</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>222,686</td>
<td>243,182</td>
<td>35,543</td>
<td>110,136</td>
<td>182,188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>252,702</td>
<td>548,853</td>
<td>183,682</td>
<td>143,329</td>
<td>231,290</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>383,150</td>
<td>641,366</td>
<td>294,094</td>
<td>364,685</td>
<td>267,507</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>425,684</td>
<td>804,878</td>
<td>519,638</td>
<td>752,466</td>
<td>300,413*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>555,881</td>
<td>781,000**</td>
<td>499,620**</td>
<td>946,571</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Provisional
**Round figure
***Does not include Nepal migrant workers who migrated to Korea through government-to-government employment permit system, and workers who migrate to India.

Figures for Nepal are reported for 12 months running from July of one year to June of the following year. For example, data for 2013 refers to the period from July 2012 to June 2013.


Exhibit 4: Top destinations for foreign employment from Nepal 2008/09 – 2014/15
Source: Department of Foreign Employment (Nepal), Labour Migration for Employment: A status report for Nepal 2014/15 (Department of Foreign Employment, 2016)
Exhibit 5: Native and foreign components of GCC labour forces (1975-2008)

Exhibit 6: Native vs. migrant population in GCC countries (2014/15)
Source: Centre for the Study of Labour and Mobility (CESLAM)
Exhibit 7: Trends in Remittance inflows for selected South Asian countries 1990-2016